



Republic of the Philippines
Supreme Court
Manila

Sirs/Mesdames:

Quoted hereunder, for your information, is a resolution of the Court En Banc dated
November 21, 2006

"G.R. No. 174153 (Raul S. Lambino, et al. vs. Commission on Elections, et al.) and G.R. No. 174299 (Mar-Len Abigail Binay, et al. vs. Commission on Elections, et al.)- The Court Resolved, *by a unanimous vote*, to **DENY** for utter lack of merit the Motion to Inhibit dated November 16, 2006 filed by counsel for intervenor Sulongbayan Movement Foundation, Inc., praying that Chief Justice Artemio V. Panganiban and Associate Justice Antonio T. Carpio inhibit themselves from the instant petitions based on the grounds cited in the motion.

The Court further Resolved to **NOTE** the

(a) Letter dated November 9, 2006 of Atty. Alan F. Paguia, questioning the Court's ruling on these cases;

(b) 1st Indorsement dated November 14, 2006 of Chief Justice Artemio V. Panganiban, referring three (3) copies of the *Message to the Supreme Court Justices* of the Philippine Misereor Partnership, Inc., stating their appreciation of the decision rendered in these cases;

(c) Aforesaid *Message to the Supreme Court Justices*;

(d) 1st Indorsement dated November 15, 2006 of Chief Justice Artemio V. Panganiban, referring the letter dated November 3, 2006 of Benigno M. Capulong relative to the decision rendered in these cases;

(e) 1st Indorsement dated November 16, 2006 of Chief Justice Artemio V. Panganiban, referring the letter (with enclosure) dated November 2, 2006 of Assistant Secretary Ma. Lourdes P. Varona, Office of the President, transmitting a copy of the e-mail letter dated October 28, 2006 of Jake Santos relative to the decision rendered in these cases; and

(f) Ex-Parte Manifestation dated November 16, 2006 filed by counsel for intervenor-oppositor Senate of the Philippines, stating that co-counsel Dean Pacifico A. Agabin received a copy of the Motion for Reconsideration of the petitioners in G.R. No. 174153, and attaching thereto the original copy of the said

November 21, 2006

motion for reconsideration together with the mailing envelope for the Court's consideration.

Acting on the following motions for reconsideration of the decision of October 25, 2006, the Court Resolved, *by the same vote of 8-7*, to **DENY WITH FINALITY** the said motions for reconsideration, as the basic issues raised therein have been duly passed upon by this Court and no substantial arguments were presented to warrant the reversal of the questioned decision:

(a) Motion for Reconsideration dated November 8, 2006 filed by the Office of the Solicitor General;

(b) Motion for Reconsideration dated November 9, 2006 filed by counsel for petitioner-intervenor Sulongbayan Movement Foundation, Inc.;

(c) Motion for Reconsideration dated November 9, 2006 filed by counsel for petitioner Erico B. Aumentado;

(d) Motion for Reconsideration dated November 9, 2006 filed by counsel for petitioner Raul L. Lambino; and


(e) Motion for Reconsideration dated November 10, 2006 filed by counsel for petitioners-intervenors Ronald L. Adamat, Rolando Manuel Rivera and Ruelo Baya, officers of the Tribal Communities Association of the Philippines.

Ten (10) Members of the Court reiterate their position, as shown by their various opinions already given when the Decision herein was promulgated, that Republic Act No. 6735 is sufficient and adequate to amend the Constitution thru a people's initiative." (adv90)

Very truly yours,

MA. LUISA D. VILLARAMA
Clerk of Court

By:


FELIPA B. ANAMA
Assistant Clerk of Court

ATTY. RAUL L. LAMBINO (x)

Petitioner

ATTY. DEMOSTHENES B. DONATO (x)

Counsel for Petitioner

Lambino De Guzman Tumanda & Rafanan

Law Firm

Autoland Sales Building

1616 Quezon Avenue, South Triangle

Diliman, 1104 Quezon City

ATTY. ALBERTO C. AGRA (x)

Counsel for Petitioner Erico B. Aumentado

No. 12, Fourth Street, St. Ignatius Village

Quezon City

ATTYS. DEMOCRITO T. MENDOZA &

CECILIO T. SENO (x)

Representative for Intervenor TUCP

TUCP Bldg., Masaya St. corner Maharlika St.

Diliman, Quezon City

SENO MENDOZA & ASSOCIATES LAW

OFFICES (x)

Counsel for Intervenor TUCP

PGEA Compound, Elliptical Road

Corner Maharlika Avenue, Diliman

Quezon City

ATTY. NERI JAVIER COLMENARES (x)

ATTY. MARVIC M.V.F. LEONEN (x)

Counsel for Intervenors-Oppositors, BAYAN

Represented by its Chairperson Dr. Carolina

Pagaduan-Araulfo, BAYAN MUNA represented by

its Chairperson Dr. Reynaldo Lesaca, KILUSANG

MAYO UNO represented by its Secretary General

Joel Maglunsod, HEAD represented by its

Secretary General Dr. Gene Alzona Nisperos,

ECUMENICAL BISHOPS FORUM represented by

Fr. Dionito Cabillas, MIGRANTE represented by its

Chairperson Concepcion Bragas-Regalado,

GABRIELA represented by its Secretary General

Emerenciana De Jesus, GABRIELA WOMEN'S

PARTY represented by Sec. General Cristina

Palabay, ANAKBAYAN represented by its

Chairperson Eleanor De Guzman, LEAGUE OF

FILIPINO STUDENTS represented by its Chair

Vener Crisostomo and Leonardo San Jose of

Bayan-NCR, Jojo Pineda of the LEAGUE OF

CONCERNED PROFESSIONALS AND

BUSINESSMEN, Dr. Darby Santiago of the

SOLIDARITY OF HEALTH AGAINST CHARTER

CHANGE and Dr. Renigald Pamugas of the

HEALTH ACTION FOR HUMAN RIGHTS

No.1 Matatag corner Maaralin Sts.

Central District, Quezon City

ATTY. PETE QUIRINO-QUADRA (x)

In His Own Behalf

Section D, 8th Flr., Ramon Magsaysay Center

1680 Roxas Blvd., Malate, 1004 Manila

SOLICITOR GENERAL ANTONIO EDUARDO B.

NACHURA (x)

ASST. SOLICITOR GENERAL REYNALDO

SOLUDARES (x)

134 Amorsolo St., Legaspi Village

Makati City 1229

CHAIRMAN BENJAMIN ABALOS (x)

ATTY. ALIODEN D. DALAIG (x)

Commission on Elections

Intramuros, 1002 Manila

ATTYS. CARLOS P. MEDINA, AMPARITA S.

STA.MARIA, GILBERT V. SEMBRANO,

MELENCIO S. STA. MARIA, GIOVANNI F.

VALLENTI, RAY PAULO J. SANTIAGO & MA.

GINA TERESA V.CHAN-GONZAGA (x)

Counsels for Oppositors One Voice, et al.

Ateneo Human Rights Center

Rm. 101, G/F, APS Building

20 Rockwell Drive, Rockwell Center

Makati City

ATTY. MARLON J. MANUEL (x)

Counsel for Movant-Intervenor Alternative

Law Groups, Inc. [ALG]

Rm. 215, Institute of Social Order

Social Development Complex

Ateneo de Manila University

Loyola Heights, Quezon City

ATTY. ARTURO M. CASTRO (x)

7F, LTA Bldg., 118 Perea St.

Legaspi Village, Makati City

ATTY. IBARRA M. GUTIERREZ III (x)

ATTY. ROSSELYNN JAYE G. DE LA CRUZ (x)

Counsel for Intervenors Loreta Ann. P.

Rosales, et al.

101 Matahimik St., Teachers' Village

Quezon City

M.M. LAZARO & ASSOCIATES (x)

Counsel for Intervenors PHILCONSA and

ESTRELLA

19F, Chatham House Bldg.

Valero corner V.A. Rufino St.

Salcedo Village, Makati City

ONGKIKO KALAW MANHIT & ACORDA LAW
OFFICES (x)
Counsel for intervenors PHILCONSA, TOLEDO
and BACUNGAN
4F, Cacho Gonzales Bldg.
101 Aguirre St., Legaspi Village
Makati City

ATTY. REYNALDO Y. MAULIT (x)
Counsel for intervenors TAJON, VENUS, AGUAS
and GAT INCIONG
4F, Du-Val Bldg., 669 Aurora Bldg., Quezon City

JUDGMENT DIVISION (x)
JUDICIAL RECORDS OFFICE (x)
PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICE (x)
CHIEF LIBRARIAN (x)
Supreme Court

ATTY. PABLO P. GARCIA (reg)
Counsel for Intervenor-Oppositors IBP Cebu City
and Cebu Chapter
2091 Andres Abellana cor Singson
Guadalupe, Cebu City 6000

ATTY. RUFUS B. RODRIGUEZ (x)
Counsel for Intervenor Estrada and PMP
RUFUS B. RODRIGUEZ & ASSOCIATES
Suite 308 Heritage Center
1851 A. Vasquez St., Malate, Manila

ATTY. AQUILINO L. PIMENTEL III (x)
Counsel for Movant Respondents-Intervenors
Pimentel, et al.
Suite 2106, Atlanta Center
No. 31 Annapolis St., Greenhills
San Juan, 1503 Metro Manila

ATTYS. ANSELMO I. CADIZ, BYRON D. BOCAR
MA. TANYA KARINA A. LAT, RANDALL C.
TABAYOYONG (x)
Respondents-Intervenors
Suite 3601, 36F Antel Global Centre
3 Julia Vargas Ave., Ortigas Center
Pasig City

ATTY. ANTONIO L. SALVADOR (x)
Respondent-Intervenor
102 Scout de Guia St., Quezon City

R.A.V. SAGUISAG (x)
Counsel for petitioners in G.R. No. 174299
4045 Bigasan St., Palanan, Makati City 1235

SENATOR MIRIAM DEFENSOR SANTIAGO (x)
Philippine Senate
Pasay City

HON. JOSE DE VENECIA (x)
Speaker, House of Representatives
Constitution Hills, Diliman 1126
Quezon City

ATTY. JANIJAY B. ALONZO (reg)
Counsel for movants R. Adamat, R.M. Rivera
and R. Baya
Counsel for movants
Block 38, Lot 12 Marawi Street
South City Homes
Biñan, Laguna

ATTY. ARNEL Z. DOLENDO (x)
DOLENDO & ASSOCIATES LAW OFFICES
Counsel for Petitioner-Intervenor
PHILIPPINE TRANSPORT & GENERAL
WORKERS ORGANIZATION AND
VICTORINO BALAIS
Rooms 504-505, S & L Building
1500 Roxas Blvd., Pasay City

RETIRED JUSTICE BERNARDO P. PARDO (x)
40 Polk St., North Greenhills, San Juan
Metro Manila

SENATOR JOKER ARROYO (x)
Philippine Senate
Pasay City

OCAMPO ARCIAGA-SANTOS NUÑEZ
LOMANGAYA AND RIBAO (x)
Counsel for Petitioner-Intervenor
2nd Flr., Ocampo Heritage Building
214 Wilson St., Greenhills, San Juan
Metro Manila

TOPACIO LAW OFFICE (x)
Co-Counsel for Petitioner-Intervenor
Camation St., Camella Classic
Better Living, Parañaque, Metro Manila

INTEGRATED BAR OF THE PHILIPPINES (x)
IBP Building, Doña Julia Vargas Avenue
1605 Pasig City

DEAN PACIFICO AGABIN (x)
26th Flr., Pacific Star Building
Gil Puyat Avenue cor. Makati Avenue
Makati City